

Contents lists available at GrowingScience

**Uncertain Supply Chain Management**homepage: [www.GrowingScience.com/uscm](http://www.GrowingScience.com/uscm)**Comments on “Vendor managed inventory with consignment stock agreement for a supply chain with defective items”****Hui-Ming Teng<sup>a</sup> and Ping-Hui Hsu<sup>b\*</sup>**<sup>a</sup>*Department of Business Administration, Chihlee University of Technology, New Taipei, Taiwan*<sup>b</sup>*Department of Business Administration, De Lin Institute of Technology, New Taipei, Taiwan***CHRONICLE****ABSTRACT***Article history:*

Received June 2, 2016

Received in revised format June 12, 2016

Accepted June 12 2016

Available online June 13 2016

*Keywords:**Vendor managed inventory**Expected total cost*

The purpose of these comments is to serve as a revision to the article by Khan et al. (2016) [Khan, M., Jaber, M.Y., Zanoni, S., & Zavanella, L. (2016). Vendor managed inventory with consignment stock agreement for a supply chain with defective items. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 40(15–16), 7102–7114.]. This commenting paper suggests that the expected total cost function derived in Khan et al. (2016) was incorrect, and then offers revisions to complement the shortcomings.

© 2016 Growing Science Ltd. All rights reserved.

Khan et al. (2016) proposed the expected total cost in Eq. (7), which was derived from the total cost in their article. This commenting paper serves to examine a query in the article that may need to be re-examined.

Eq. (7) of their article is as follows,

$$E[TC] = A_v + \lambda A_b + d\lambda q + \frac{\lambda h_v q^2}{2p} + (h_b'' + h_v')q^2 \quad (1)$$

$$\times [\lambda(\frac{D}{2P^2} + \frac{E[\gamma]}{x}) + \frac{1}{2}(1 - E[\gamma] - \frac{D}{P})\{\frac{\lambda(\lambda+1)}{P} + \lambda^2(\frac{1-E[\gamma]}{D} - \frac{1}{P})\}].$$

This equation was derived from the total cost (before Eq. (7)) as follows

$$TC = A_v + \lambda A_b + d\lambda q + \frac{\lambda h_v q^2}{2p} + (h_b'' + h_v')q^2 \quad (2)$$

$$\times [\lambda(\frac{D}{2P^2} + \frac{\gamma}{x}) + \frac{1}{2}(1 - \gamma - \frac{D}{P})\{\frac{\lambda(\lambda+1)}{P} + \lambda^2(\frac{1-\gamma}{D} - \frac{1}{P})\}].$$

\* Corresponding author

E-mail address: [pinghuhsu@gmail.com](mailto:pinghuhsu@gmail.com) (P.-H. Hsu)

However, upon further inspection one can see an error in the last part of Eq. (2),  $\frac{1}{2}(1-\gamma - \frac{D}{P})\{\frac{\lambda(\lambda+1)}{P} + \lambda^2(\frac{1-\gamma}{D} - \frac{1}{P})\}$ . This expands to a term of  $\gamma^2$ .  $E[\gamma^2]$  will be in the expected total cost  $E[TC]$ . Since,  $E[\gamma^2] \neq \{E[\gamma]\}^2$  (Bain & Engelhardt (1991), pp.78-70), this shows that Eq. (1) is incorrect.

The correct equation should be rewritten as follows,

$$\begin{aligned} E[TC] = & A_v + \lambda A_b + d\lambda q + \frac{\lambda h_v q^2}{2p} + (h_b'' + h_v') q^2 \lambda \left( \frac{D}{2P^2} + \frac{E[\gamma]}{x} \right) \\ & + (h_b'' + h_v') q^2 \frac{1}{2} (1 - E[\gamma] - \frac{D}{P}) \left\{ \frac{\lambda(\lambda+1)}{P} \right\} \\ & + (h_b'' + h_v') q^2 \frac{\lambda^2}{2} \left( \frac{1 - 2E[\gamma] + E[\gamma^2]}{D} + \frac{-2 + 2E[\gamma] + \frac{D}{P}}{P} \right). \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

## References

- Bain, L. J., & Engelhardt, M. (1991). *Introduction to probability and mathematical statics*. Belmont California: 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, An imprint of Wadsworth publishing company.
- Khan, M., Jaber, M.Y., Zanoni, S., & Zavanella, L. (2016). Vendor managed inventory with consignment stock agreement for a supply chain with defective items. *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 40(15–16), 7102–7114.